



## Call for Transparent, Impartial and Pluralist Expert Assessment on health risks of non-ionizing electromagnetic fields (EMF)

Strasbourg, November 14, 2011

**TO: Commissioner John DALLI, Health and Consumer Policy**

CC: Commissioner Janez Potočnik, Environment

Commissioner Máire Geoghegan-Quinn, Research, Innovation and Science.

*In the perspective of DG Sanco's scientific conference on Electromagnetic fields and Public Health, Nov 16-18, 2011, and IARC's classification of radiofrequency (RF) EMF as "Possibly Carcinogen" we, NGOs, MEPs and other public interest stakeholders state the following:*

- We are writing to express our concerns over the narrow range of speakers and agenda items for the November 16-18 EU Commission conference on EMF, and over the lack of transparency and pluralism in the evaluation of evidence by SCENIHR and other EU risk assessment committees.
- We are concerned about the lack of transparency, impartiality and pluralism in the selection of:
  - o the members of the steering committee
  - o the experts represented at the conference
  - o the agenda items
- There is solid evidence, from their published work for example, that most speakers, as well as most members of the steering committee which appointed them, share the same opinion on EMF health risks and support the highly controversial "ICNIRP interpretation" of the evidence on the biological effects of non-ionizing radiation. This viewpoint is only one of several scientific judgments in the well-known controversy of EMF health risks. The November group is hence not intellectually impartial according to the Commission's own standards as set out on its successful submission on this issue to the WTO Appeal Court on the beef hormones case.
- **We believe there is an effective risk that an imbalanced panel would ignore or play down the full range of plausible scientific and empirical evidence of health risks, including IARC's recent classification of RF fields as "possibly carcinogen". This would misguide the EU Commission, hinder the needed review of the Commission's recommendations, and postpone the implementation of cost-efficient preventive measures.**<sup>1</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> "Late lessons from early warnings: the precautionary principle 1896–2000", European Environmental Agency, 2002. Download the report [here](#).

- We agree when the Commission, on its Communication on the Precautionary Principle (2000), recommends that “the degree of scientific uncertainty should be presented correctly”, and states that the precautionary principle is applicable before a risk has been “determined with sufficient certainty.”
- We fear that the reputation and credibility of DG Sanco will suffer if the present unintentional unevenness is not adjusted. We are confident that you, Commissioner Dalli, agree that pluralism is necessary for rational decision-making, and that you are as attached to transparency, impartiality and democracy as we, the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe (PACE) and WHO’s International Agency for Research on Cancer (IARC) are.<sup>2</sup>
- This is not an isolated case. Many EU risk assessment committee reports, despite some advice on handling uncertainties from EFSA Scientific Committee, do not provide a fully transparent, traceable account of the process for evaluating evidence and drawing conclusions. In some cases summaries of reports do not correctly reflect the evidence from underlying chapters something for which IPCC has also been criticized. We have noted the recent critique of IPCC by the global scientific authority, the Inter-Academy Council, for failing to be sufficiently transparent about scientific uncertainties and for failing to provide a “traceable account” of the process of evidence evaluation and concluding judgments and their justifications.
- Such advice has since been formally endorsed by the IPCC in its revised guidance to lead authors on handling uncertainty in the next IPCC report on climate change.

We therefore ask you to:

- 1. Assure that current and upcoming expert appointment processes are transparent and managed by a balanced steering committee.**
- 2. Add time for a presentation of alternative scientific interpretations to the November conference.**
- 3. Consider the citizens’ view-points and experience as a complement to expert assessment. Consequently invite representatives from the International EMF Alliance (IEMFA) and other relevant public interest groups and assemblies to the upcoming conference and other EMF-related events.**
- 4. Establish and publish a policy for risk assessment committees assuring pluralism and transparency and avoiding conflicts of interest and other bias. This guidance could be similar to that produced by IPCC.**
- 5. Ensure high standard, pluralism and impartiality when selecting experts for particular reports or issues where intellectual or other bias is plausible.**
- 6. Organise a conference on EMF health risks where all main scientific factions are represented, including those who conclude there are risks and a need for prevention.**

We thank you for your attention, and for considering our request.

Respectfully Yours,

---

<sup>2</sup> IARC has stated that an IARC Monograph demands “*independence from all commercial interests and from advocates that might be perceived as advancing conceived position*”. This policy was welcomed by civil society representatives and made the participation of several controversial scientists impossible (e.g. Prof Ahlbom).

## International EMF Alliance ([IEMFA](#))

*Sissel Halmøy, Folkets Strålevern, Norway, Chair*

*Alex Swinkels, Netherlands, Board member*

*Eileen O'Connor, EM Radiation Research Trust, UK, Board member*

*Kerstin Stenberg, Priartem, France, Board member*

### **IEMFA represents the following [organisations](#):**

- Alliance for Irish Radiation Protection
  - American Association for Cell Phone Safety
  - ASANACEM/EEKNE
  - Associació Oikos Ambiental
  - Association for Environmental and Chronic exposure Injury
  - Association for Electro Hypersensitive
  - Association for Electrosensitive in Finland
  - Association for the Protection of Health and the Environment
  - Associazione Italiana Elettrosensibili
  - AVAATE
  - Bio Electromagnetic Research Initiative
  - Cell Tower Dangers
  - Center for Safer Wireless
  - Citizens for Safe Technology
  - Citizens' Radiation Protection
  - California Brain Tumor Association
  - Defense Association of Health and Environment
  - Ecologists in Action (Ecologistas en Acción)
  - EHS Association of Electrosensitives
  - EKEUKO-COVACE
  - Elektrosmog-Info
  - Elettrosmog Volturino-onlus
  - Electric Sense
  - Electrical Pollution Solutions
  - Electrosensitive Society
  - Electromagnetic Radiation Research Foundation
  - Electromagnetic Safety Alliance
  - Electrohypersensitivity Foundation (Stichting EHS)
  - Electromagnetic Fields Protection Alliance
  - ElectromagneticHealth.org
  - EMFacts Consultancy
  - EMF Refugee
  - EMR Australia
  - EM Radiation Research Trust
  - EMR Policy Institute
  - Environmental Health Trust
  - ElectroSensitive Association (FEB)
  - Escuela sin WIFI
  - Green Warriors of Norway
  - Health Defense Organization
  - IGEF The International Society for electromagnetic research
  - Kitakamakurakeitaing
  - KompetenzInitiative
  - La Fundación Vivo Sano
  - Limit the Radiation (Beperk de Straling)
  - Mast Action UK
  - Mast-Victims
  - Mast Sanity
  - NEXT-up Organisation
  - National Platform on Radiation Risks
  - Our Children's Future (Vore Børns Fremtid)
  - Pandora Foundation
  - PRIARTÉM
  - Powerwatch
  - Radiation Education
- Ireland  
USA  
Spain  
Spain  
Italy  
Norway  
Finland  
Chile  
Italy  
Spain  
United Kingdom  
United States  
United States  
Canada  
Norway  
United States  
Chile  
Spain  
Denmark  
Spain  
Switzerland  
Italy  
United States  
United States  
United Kingdom  
South Africa  
United States  
Netherlands  
Malaysia  
United States  
Australia  
United States  
Australia  
United Kingdom  
United States  
United States  
Sweden  
Spain  
Norway  
Spain  
Germany  
Japan  
Germany  
Spain  
Belgium  
United Kingdom  
United Kingdom  
United Kingdom  
France  
Netherlands  
Denmark  
Germany  
France  
United Kingdom  
Canada

### Cont. IEMFA supporting organisations

- |  |                |
|--|----------------|
| • Rete Elettrosmog free Italia                             | Italy          |
| • Robin des Toits  | France         |
| • StopUMTS   | Netherlands    |
| • StralingsArmVlaanderen                                   | Belgium        |
| • Teslabel   | Belgium        |
| • The People's Initiative Foundation                       | United States  |
| • VGM Verein für Gesundheitsverträglichen Mobilfunk        | Lichtenstein   |
| • WaveBreaker (Vågbrytaren)                                | Sweden         |
| • WEEP (Wireless Electrical and Electromagnetic Pollution) | Canada         |
| • WiFi in schools  | United Kingdom |
| • Wirelesswatchblog  | United States  |
| • WiredChild   | United Kingdom |

### International and pan-European NGOs

- Health and Environment Alliance, HEAL, (> [70](#) member organisations)
- Women in Europe for a Common Future, WECF ([100](#) member organisations)
- Pesticide Action Network-Europe, PAN-Europe ([31](#) member organisations)

### Other Non Governmental Organisations and Coalitions

- |  |                |
|--|----------------|
| • Réseau Environnement Santé ( <a href="#">21</a> associations)  | France         |
| • Bund für Umwelt und Naturschutz Deutschland e.V. (BUND)/ Friends of the Earth ( <a href="#">480 000</a> members) | Germany        |
| • The Wireless Radiation Safety Council  | Canada         |
| • The Coalition to Stop Smart Meters,  | Canada         |
| • R.I.S.K. (Rebutting Industry Science with Knowledge)   | Belgium        |
| • Swedish Radiation Protection Foundation  | Sweden         |
| • Initiativ Liewensufank   | Luxembourg     |
| • British Society for Ecological Medicine  | United Kingdom |
| • BUND Naturschutz in Bayern   | Germany        |
| • AKUT   | Luxemburg      |
| • Irish Doctors Environmental Association (IDEA)   | Ireland        |
| • Irish Electromagnetic Radiation Victims Network (IERVN)  | Ireland        |
| • Diagnose-Funk e.V.   | Germany        |
| • Diagnose-Funk e.V.   | Switzerland    |
| • The GalileO Project  | USA            |
| • C.H.A.S.M. (Coalition for Health / Against Smart Meters)   | USA            |
| • PACTS, People Against Cell Towers at Schools   | USA            |
| • A.P.P.L.E. Associazione Per la Prevenzione e Lotta all'Elettrosmog   | Italy          |
| • Ezpitsua, Basque Country   | Spain          |
| • Ekologistak Martxan, Basque Country  | Spain          |
| • h.e.s.e project  | Germany        |
| • Elektrosmognews  | Germany        |
| • ASQUIFYDE  | Spain          |
| • PMI - Plattform Mobilfunk-Initiativen  | Austria        |
| • The Santa Fe Alliance for Public Health & Safety   | USA            |
| • Doctors W.A.R.N  | USA            |
| • Advisory Board Doctors for Safer Schools   | Canada         |

### Members of the European Parliament (MEPs)

- |                    |        |         |
|--------------------|--------|---------|
| • Michèle RIVASI   | Greens | France  |
| • Kriton ARSENIS   | S&D    | Greece  |
| • Frédérique RIES  | ALDE   | Belgium |
| • Jo LEINEN        | S&D    | Germany |
| • Isabelle DURANT, | Greens | Belgium |
| • Guido MILANA     | S&D    | Italy   |

### Cont. Members of the European Parliament

• Pavel POC	S&D	Czech Republic
• Liisa JAAKONSAARI	S&D	Finland
• Claudiu Ciprian TĂNĂSESCU	S&D	Romania
• Antonyia PARVANOVA	ALDE	Bulgaria
• Dr. Charles TANNOCK	ECR	United Kingdom
• Heide RÜHLE	Greens	Germany
• Michail Tremopoulos	Greens	Greece
• Satu HASSI	Greens	Finland

### Scientists and Medical doctors (IEMFA and others)

Dr. Adamantia Fragopoulou, BSc, MSc, PhD	Athens (Greece)
Prof. Dr. Alvaro Augusto Almeida de Salles, BSc, MSc, PhD	Porto Alegre (Brazil)
Dr. Andrew Goldsworthy, BSc, PhD	London (United Kingdom)
Anton Merkulov, MSc, MSc	Moscow (Russia)
Barrie Trower, Bed	Devon (United Kingdom)
Dr. Carl F. Blackman, PhD	Raleigh (United States)
Prof. Dr. Ceferino Maestu Unturbe, MD, PhD	Madrid (Spain)
Cindy Sage, MA	Santa Barbara (US)
Prof. Dr. Devra Lee Davis, PhD, MPH	Pittsburg (United States)
Prof. Dr. Dominique Belpomme, MD	Paris (France)
Dr. Fredrik Söderqvist, DMedSc	Örebro (Sweden)
Prof. Dr. Elihu D. Richter, MD, MPH	Jerusalem (Israel)
Prof. Dr. Franz Adlkofer, MD	München (Germany)
Prof. Dr. Henry Lai, BSc, PhD	Seattle (United States)
Dr. Isaac Jamieson, PhD, DIC, RIBA, DipAAS, BSc	London (United Kingdom)
Prof. Dr. Rer. Nat. Lebrecht von Klitzing	Stockelsdorf (Germany)
L. Lloyd Morgan, BSc	Berkeley (United States)
Prof. Dr. Lukas H. Margaritis, PhD	Athens (Greece)
Prof. Dr. Nesrin Seyhan, PhD, MSc	Ankara (Turkey)
Dr. Magda Havas, BSc, PhD	Peterborough (Canada)
Prof. Dr. Martin Blanc, MD, PhD	New York (United States)
Prof. Dr. Olle Johansson, MD, PhD	Stockholm (Sweden)
Örjan Hallberg, MSc	Trångsund (Sweden)
Roger Coghill, MA	Pontypool (United Kingdom)
Dr. Sam Milham, MD, MPH	Washington (United States)
Prof. Dr. Stanislaw Szmigielski, MD, PhD	Warsaw (Poland)
Dr. Stelios A. Zinelis, MD, BA, PhD	Athens (Greece)
Dr. Sarah Starkey, BSc, MSc, PhD	London (United Kingdom)
Dr. Rer. Nat. Ulrich Warnke	Saarbrücken (Germany)
Prof. Dr. Yury Grigoriev, MD	Moscow (Russia)
Dr. Zamir P. Shalita, MD, PhD	Ramat Gan (Israel)
Prof. Livio Giuliani , ICEMS spokesperson	Italy
Prof Dr. Lennart Hardell, MD, PhD	Sweden
Prof. Dr. Klaus Buchner	Germany
Dr. Ernesto Burgio, Pediatrician, President ISDE Scientific Office	Italy
Dr. Ann Louise Gittleman	USA
Dr. Anna Zuccherro	Italy
Dr. Christine Aschermann	Germany
Dr. Joachim Mutter	Germany
Dr. Annie J Sasco, MD, MPH, SM, DrPH, HDR, Former IARC Unit Chief	France

### Cont. Scientists and Medical doctors (IEMFA and others)

Dr. Gerd Oberfeld	Austria
Dr. Kerry Crofton	Canada
Susan Foster, MSW	USA
Dr. Thor Teong Gee	Malaysia
Michael Carlberg, MSc	Sweden
Dr. Med. Wolf Bergmann	Germany
Dr. Environ. Med. Barbara Dohmen	Germany
Dr. Med. Markus Kern	Germany
Prof. Dr. Klaus Buchner	Germany
Dr. Carlos Sosa, MD	Colombia
Prof. Osmo Hänninen, (emeritus)	Finland
Dr. Seppo Kinnunen, MD	Finland

### Lawyers and other public interest stakeholders

Dr. Iur. Edvard Christian Schöpfer	Austria
Bernd Budzinski, Lawyer, judge (retired)	Germany
Antero Kassinen, Lawyer	Finland
Mats Dämvik, Lawyer	Sweden
Sven Leistikow, Lawyer	Germany
Johan Bonander: Clergyman, freelance journalist	Sweden
Mona Nilsson, Journalist, author	Sweden
B. Blake Levitt, author	USA

- Enclosures:**
1. IEMFA's "General opinion on risk assessment".
  2. « European Parliament resolution of 2 April 2009 on health concerns associated with electromagnetic fields » (2008/2211(INI). [The Ries-resolution](#).
  3. The Parliamentary Assembly of the Council of Europe's resolution on « The potential dangers of electromagnetic fields and their effect on the environment ». [Resolution 1815](#).
  4. "Health risks from mobile phone radiation – why the experts disagree", European Environment Agency, October 12, 2011. [EEA statement](#).

**Contact persons:** Kerstin Stenberg, IEMFA [kerstin@international-emf-alliance.org](mailto:kerstin@international-emf-alliance.org)  
Alex Swinkels, IEMFA [alex@international-emf-alliance.org](mailto:alex@international-emf-alliance.org)

IEMFA, c/o Stenberg, 25 rue Ste Odile, FR-67530 Boersch, FRANCE

