

Enclosure 3

SCENIHR members' history (intellectual and financial bias)

INTRODUCTION

Unbalanced and biased expertise on EMF

The European Commission expertise on EMF has since 2004 only included experts with an industry-friendly viewpoint and interpretation of the scientific literature. In the 2015 review, one single SCENIHR committee member was in charge of steering the process and selecting the experts assisting him. Nine of the ten selected experts have been involved with standards committees in the past who have repeatedly underplayed evidence that pointed to health effects - most notably **ICNIRP**, **WHO-EMF Project**, the Swedish Radiation Protection Authority (**SSM**) and the UK's **AGNIR**. An updated opinion from such a group is likely to be consistent with the opinions they've previously expressed.

A context of industry influence

The European Ombudsman published a strong report in January 2015 criticizing the lack of transparency that surrounds the powerful experts groups called upon by the European Commission.¹ *"The Ombudsman calls on the Commission to establish a legally binding framework for all expert groups, including a definition of what balanced representation in different groups should look like. She also recommends measures to reduce potential conflict of interest situations and to publish more information about the work of the groups. The Commission should reply to her proposals by 30 April 2015"*

A recent article about industry influence published in BMJ describes the tobacco companies intensive lobbying through third-party experts. *"The study confirmed previous research showing that the Smart Regulation agenda enables corporate interests to exert undue influence and therefore risks undermining European Union public health policy... The analysis revealed that industry-lobbying tactics were deployed on a "massive" scale. Philip Morris International alone employed over 160 lobbyists, and described third party involvement as "key to success."*² Influencing expert group is one of these efficient third party methods, and the Corporate Europe Observatory has revealed that companies had scientists issuing opinions in expert groups on toxic chemicals they themselves manufactured.³ Is there any reason to believe that the powerful Telecom industry does not apply the most efficient methods available, and that this has not contributed to the unbalanced composition and position of the SCENIHR expert group(s)?

1. <http://www.aecr.eu/eu-ombudsman-criticises-secrecy-surrounding-powerful-eu-policy-committees/>

2 Massive" tobacco industry third party lobbying for revised European Directive, BMJ 2015;
<http://www.bmj.com/company/wp-content/uploads/2015/02/toba-lobb.pdf>

3. http://corporateeurope.org/sites/default/files/attachments/ceo_-_sanco_sc_conflicts_of_interest.pdf

SCENIHR 2015 EMF working group experts

Prof. Samaras Theodoros

Intellectual bias: Repeatedly affirming there are no health risks (specialist in technical aspects)

Financial bias: Received funding for development of a library management system based on radiofrequency fields. Former employee of IT'IS Foundation an organization funded by major telecom companies. Present external advisor to IT'IS Foundation.⁴ COST BM 0704 management participant for which IT'IS Foundation was appointed as the Grant Holder

Potential conflicts of interest: WHO Scientific consultant and advisor to Vodaphone.

Panaphone, Athens. Dr. Samaras is "a long-term friend and colleague of the IT'IS foundation".⁵ Associate member of IEEE⁶ an industry dominated organization which has also sponsored several of his publications.

Influence/expert groups: Member of SCENIHR 2015

Prof. Anssi Auvinen

Intellectual bias: Repeatedly concluded there are no health risks

Potential financial bias: Funding from telecom industry for COSMOS study (MMF, Mobile Manufacturers Forum). Previous funding for Interphone study from GSM Association and MMF, and from a Finish research program financed by Nokia, TeliaSonera, Elisa, DNA

Potential conflicts of interest:

Influence/expert groups: Member of ICNIRP 2012-2014, SCENIHR 2015, previous SCENIHR EMF working group, and Swedish Radiation Safety Authority expert group (SSM) 2009-2010.

Prof. Dr. Heidi Danker- Hopfe

Intellectual bias: Repeatedly concluded there are no health risks

Potential financial bias:

Potential conflicts of interest:

Influence/expert groups: Member of SCENIHR 2015, German Commission of Radiological Protection, and the Swedish Radiation Safety Authority's expert group (SSM).

Dr. Kjell Hansson Mild

Intellectual bias: Repeatedly concluded there are no health risks from wifi and mobile masts. Recognizes a brain tumour risk from mobile phone use. SCENIHR 2015: did not express a minority view.

Potential financial bias:

Potential conflicts of interest: Member of Telia Sonera advisory expert group since 2000.

⁴ IT'IS Foundation annual report 2012

⁵ <http://www.itis.ethz.ch/news-events/news/awards/award-for-best-scientific-paper-presented-by-a-student-at-bioem2013/>

⁶ <http://ieeexplore.ieee.org/xpl/login.jsp?tp=&arnumber=5940202&url=http%3A%2F%2Fieeexplore.ieee.org%2Fiel5%2F7727%2F5730210%2F05940202.pdf%3Farnumber%3D5940202>

Influence/expert groups: Membre SCENIHR 2015. Member COST BM0704

Prof. Mats- Olof Mattsson

Intellectual bias: Repeatedly concluded there are no health risks

Potential financial bias: Received funding from FGF, (German Telecom industry organisation). Listed in Austrian mobile phone advisory group that has received funding from the telecom companies.⁷

Potential conflicts of interest: Member of Telia Sonera advisory expert group

Influence/expert groups: SCENIHR 2015. SCENIHR chair 2009. Member of expert group Wissenschafts Beirat Funk serving governmental institutions in Austria. Member **ICNIRP**

Dr. Hannu Norppa

Intellectual bias: Repeatedly concluded there are no health risks

Potential financial bias:

Potential conflicts of interest:

Influence/expert groups: SCENIHR 2015. SCENIHR committee member since 2009.

Dr. James Rubin

Intellectual bias: Repeatedly affirming psychological causes of electrohypersensitivity.

Potential financial bias: Research funding from MTHR UK, a research program partly funded by the telecommunication industry.

Potential conflicts of interest:

Influence/expert groups: SCENIHR 2015. Member Advisory Group on Non-Ionising Radiation, **AGNIR** 2012 and Didcot (UK), contributing author on **WHO EMF-project's** Health Criteria on RF (2012-)

Dr. Maria Rosaria Scarfi

Intellectual bias: Repeatedly concluded there are no health risks

Potential financial bias: Funding from industry (Telecom Italia and CTIA -wireless industry).

Potential conflicts of interest:

Influence/expert groups: SCENIHR 2015. Member of Cost BM0704; member of Italian Electrotechnical Committee on EMF (an Italian standardization organization); Member of **WHO EMF-project's** core expert group on Environmental Health Criteria on RF-EMF 2014; Member of Swedish Radiation Safety Authority expert group **SSM**; consulting expert **ICNIRP**.

Dr. Joachim Schüz

Intellectual bias: Repeatedly concluded there are no health risks

Potential financial bias: Funding from Danish Mobile Phone operators for the initial funding of the Danish Cohort study on mobile phone use and brain tumours. Participated in Interphone that received half of its funding from GSM Association and MMF. Currently participating in the Cosmos study⁸, which is also funded by telecom industry. Previous funding from EPRI, an American organization funded by the electric industry.

7. <http://www.wbf.or.at/wbf-expertenforum/expertenforum-2009/expertenliste/>

8. <http://www.thecosmosproject.org/partners.php>

Potential conflicts of interest: Listed in Austrian mobile phone advisory group that has received funding from the telecom companies.⁹

Influence/expert groups: Member of SCENIHR expert group on EMF since many years; previous EMF expert group member of the German Commission on Radiation Protection (BFS), member Austrian Wissenschaftfunk expert group, the EMF expert group COST BM0704 Management Committee, EFHRAN member, works for IARC.

Dr. Zenon Sienkiewicz

Intellectual bias: Repeatedly concluded there are no health risks

Financial bias: Member of British jointly industry funded research program (MTHR).

Potential conflicts of interest: Holds shares in British Telecom.

Influence/expert groups: SCENIHR 2015. ICNIRP 2012-2014

Dr. Olga Zeni

Intellectual bias: Repeatedly concluded there are no health risks

Financial bias: Previous funding from Telecom Italia and CTIA, Italy (wireless industry)

Potential conflicts of interest:

Influence/expert groups: SCENIHR 2015. Expert at the WHO EMF-project's Health Criteria on RF. Member EU EMF expert group EMF-NET on TetraHertz radiation.

Norbert Leitgeb *to be completed*

Intellectual bias:

Financial bias:

Potential conflicts of interest:

Influence/expert groups:

9. <http://www.wbf.or.at/wbf-expertenforum/expertenforum-2009/expertenliste/>